Understanding innovative public-private partnerships at the food-energy-water-environment Nexus

Dr. Pete Barbrook-Johnson
UKRI Innovation Fellow, University of Surrey

www.innovativeppp.org | @bapeterj | p.barbrook-johnson@surrey.ac.uk

UK Research and Innovation

[Logos of ESRC, NERC, and CECAN]
Overview – ongoing work!

❖ Fellowship aims
  • Work with industry and support the Industrial Strategy
    • Support and work with innovative PPP
    • Critical review of PPP
    • Appraisal and evaluation frameworks for PPP

❖ UK context and motivation

❖ Literature

❖ Critical review of Nexus PPP in UK

❖ South Lincs Water Partnership

❖ Next steps
What are PPPs?

- ‘Cooperative institutional arrangements between public and private sectors actors’

Little agreement on what they are:
- new helpful tool
- reformulation of public management
  - language game!
- ‘contracting’
- are they even ‘new’?
- Focus on infrastructure – why?
## What are PPPs?

### Table 1: A Typology of Public–Private Partnerships Based on Financial and Organizational Relationships

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Finance/Organization</th>
<th>Tight Organizational Relationship</th>
<th>Loose Organizational Relationship</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tight financial</td>
<td>Joint-venture companies</td>
<td>BOOT, BOT, Sale-and-lease-back</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>relationship</td>
<td>Joint stock companies</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Joint development projects</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Policy communities</td>
<td>Issue networks</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Loose financial</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>relationship</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Hodge and Greve (2007)
[https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-6210.2007.00736.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-6210.2007.00736.x)
‘Working in partnership’

- Calls for more multi-sector working and partnerships
  - 25 year env plan
  - Industrial Strategy
  - Clean Growth Strategy
- October 2018 Budget
  - Government will no longer use PFI/PF2 project model
Motivation

My assertion(s):
· Despite end of PFI/PF2 -> PPP will go on being used
· Even if we get a Corbyn government!
· Local and national governments with neoliberal and public management worldviews will lean towards them
· In infrastructure terms, the basic economics demand it
· There are synergies with the need for joined-up nexus and complexity-appropriate governance
  · i.e. multi-sector ownership and management more likely to deliver cross-nexus and complexity-appropriate governance

Let’s appropriate PPP as:
· decentralized power and empowered communities
· better Nexus governance
· more complexity-appropriate

Let’s look at what is out there, what we can learn from it (and how we might scale it)
Critical review of nexus PPP in UK/England and Wales

- **Aim:** Catalogue and understand what other types of PPP are out there right now, what they are doing, how they are different

- **Semi-systematic searching:**
  - Search for ‘partnership’ in all gov.uk content from Defra, BEIS, EA, FSA, MMO, OFWAT, OFGEM, DfT, CEFA, APHA, NE
  - Search corporate sites of:
    - Big 6 energy companies
    - All England and Wales water companies
    - All supermarkets with >5% market share
    - Might search smaller water and energy companies, wholesale food markets
  - Search 3 gov strategies
  - Google search for key terms – UK only, since 2010
  - Twitter
  - Thecasescentre.org
  - Academic articles

- **Definition issues** – include if collaboration between private sector and public sector organisations, but NOT if:
  - “Just working together”
  - A funded project with no evidence of previous
  - Only private member is one of the standard trade assocs
  - Simple/bilateral payment for activity/service (grouped/coordinated)
Critical review: prelim findings

- Many in ‘water’ and ‘environment’
  - Tend to be small scale
  - Flood and water management
  - Conservation
  - Forests
  - Beaches
  - Water companies as lone private sector org

- Few in ‘food’ and ‘energy’
  - Tend to be national in scale
  - Food production, not consumption
  - Energy and social issues -> education and poverty
  - Industry councils

- Several gov backed ‘groups’ of partnerships
  - LEPs, LNP, CaBA, LBAPs, Pioneers
  - Mandated partnerships vary a lot

- More at local levels?
- Infrastructure not typically the product
Critical review: next steps

- NGO-private partnerships
  - Energy Education
  - Energy poverty
  - Fundraising
  - Food reuse and recycling
  - ‘Improve our site for us’
- Devolved government
- Final searches
- Further analysis
  - Legal forms
    - Extend Hodge and Greve table?
  - Funding sources
  - ‘Product’
    - Decisions and capacity
    - Goods and services
      - Conservation
      - Infrastructure
  - Outcomes
  - Scalability
  - How ‘public’?
Working with South Lincs Water Partnership

- 2 years old, formed out of Water Resources East (strategic water planning project led by Anglian Water)
- Public water supply, flood risk management, agriculture, environment, business, tourism and leisure sectors
- End goal of supplying lots of drinking water and developing lots of co-benefits (flood, water for ag, conservation, leisure etc) by building some reservoir(s)
  - If they don’t, someone else will, badly
- Lots of scoping already done, now want to get on with it!
Summing up and next steps

- We need better models of PPP and we need to share them
- Critical review finish and write up
  - **Help** – examples and literature
- Working with SLWP
  - Go with the flow
- Appraisal and evaluation frameworks for PPP
  - Be bold or sensible
    - Bold: interactive model / serious game based on my review, observations, and others’ models
    - Sensible: match methods, questions, and partnership characteristics for maximum appraisal and evaluation appropriateness
  - Be both: bold on appraisal, sensible on eval
THANK YOU

innovativeppp.org

@bapeterj

p.barbrook-johnson@surrey.ac.uk